Much work has been done examining the consequences of social exclusion. Of particular note in recent years, some work has found that social exclusion results in social pain (e.g., decreased self-esteem, worsened mood) while other work has found relative emotional numbness. Similarly, while some work has shown social exclusion results in a numbing to physical pain, other work suggests potentially contradictory finding. In four studies, we examine potential moderators of this apparent contradiction, finding that the paradigms used to manipulate rejection are themselves confounded with the key moderating variable - the severity of the social exclusion experience.